



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

# Industrial Competition and Combination



## THE ANNALS

VOLUME XLII

JULY, 1912

---

EDITOR: EMORY R. JOHNSON

ASSISTANT EDITOR: ELLERY C. STOWELL

EDITOR BOOK DEPARTMENT: ROSWELL C. MCCREA

ASSOCIATE EDITORS: THOMAS CONWAY, JR., G. G. HUEBNER, S. S. HUEBNER  
CARL KELSEY, CLYDE L. KING, J. P. LICHTENBERGER, L. S. ROWE

---

AMERICAN ACADEMY OF POLITICAL AND SOCIAL SCIENCE  
36TH AND WOODLAND AVENUE, PHILADELPHIA

---

EUROPEAN AGENTS

ENGLAND P. S. King & Son, 2 Great Smith St., Westminster, London, S. W.  
FRANCE: L. Larose, Rue Soufflot, 22, Paris

GERMANY: Mayer & Müller, 2 Prinz Louis Ferdinandstrasse, Berlin, N. W.

ITALY: Giornale Degli Economisti, via Monte Savello, Palazzo Orsini, Rome

SPAIN: E. Dossat, 9 Plaza de Santa Ana, Madrid

KRAUS REPRINT CO.

Millwood, New York

1975

Copyright, 1912, by  
THE AMERICAN ACADEMY OF POLITICAL AND SOCIAL SCIENCE  
All rights reserved.

*Reprinted with the permission of the*  
*American Academy of Political and Social Science*  
**KRAUS REPRINT CO.**  
A U.S. Division of Kраus-Thomson Organization Limited

Printed in U.S.A.

## CONTENTS

---

### PART I

#### THE EFFECT OF INDUSTRIAL COMBINATIONS ON LABOR CONDITIONS

	PAGE
HARMFUL EFFECTS OF INDUSTRIAL COMBINATIONS ON LABOR CONDITIONS.....	3
<i>John Williams</i> , President, Amalgamated Association of Iron, Steel and Tin Workers, Pittsburgh.	
THE UNITED STATES STEEL CORPORATION AND LABOR..	10
<i>John A. Fitch</i> , "The Survey," New York.	
BENEFICIAL EFFECTS OF INDUSTRIAL COMBINATIONS ON LABOR CONDITIONS.....	20
<i>R. S. Woodward, Jr.</i> , Vice-President and General Manager, Standard Roller Bearing Company, Philadelphia.	
BIG BUSINESS AND LABOR.....	25
<i>James T. McCleary</i> , Secretary, American Iron and Steel Institute, New York.	
THE UNITED STATES STEEL CORPORATION AND LABOR CONDITIONS.....	38
<i>Raynal C. Bolling</i> , Assistant General Solicitor, United States Steel Corporation, New York.	
DISCUSSION.....	48

---

### PART II

#### COMPETITION AS A SAFEGUARD TO NATIONAL WELFARE

THE POSSIBILITY OF COMPETITION IN COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY.....	63
<i>John Bates Clark, LL.D.</i> , Professor of Political Economy, Columbia University.	
UNFAIR COMPETITION BY MONOPOLISTIC CORPORATIONS..	67
<i>Bruce Wyman, A.M., LL.B.</i> , Professor of Law, Harvard University.	
COMPETITION AS A SAFEGUARD TO NATIONAL WELFARE...	74
<i>Talcott Williams, LL.D.</i> , Philadelphia.	

	PAGE
THE FALLACY OF "BIG BUSINESS".....	83
<b>E. S. Meade, Ph.D.</b> , Professor of Finance, University of Pennsylvania.	
COMPETITION: THE SAFEGUARD AND PROMOTER OF GENERAL WELFARE.....	89
<b>George F. Canfield</b> , Professor of Law, Columbia University.	
PUBLICITY OF ACCOUNTS OF INDUSTRIAL CORPORATIONS.	98
<b>Miles M. Dawson</b> , Counsellor-at-Law and Consulting Actuary, New York.	
UNREGULATED COMPETITION IS DESTRUCTIVE OF NATIONAL WELFARE.....	108
<b>Allen Ripley Foote</b> , President, National Tax Association, Columbus, Ohio.	

---

### PART III

#### **THE RELATION OF INDUSTRIAL COMBINATIONS TO NATIONAL WELFARE**

THE BENEFITS OF INDUSTRIAL COMBINATIONS.....	119
<b>J. Kirby, Jr.</b> , President, National Association of Manufacturers, Dayton, Ohio.	
INDUSTRIAL COMBINES AND NATIONAL PROGRESS.....	125
<b>J. K. Gwynn</b> , American Tobacco Company, New York.	
CONTRIBUTION OF INDUSTRIAL COMBINATIONS TO NATIONAL WELFARE.....	134
<b>Magnus W. Alexander</b> , Of the General Electric Company, West Lynn, Mass.	
PUBLICITY IN AFFAIRS OF INDUSTRIAL COMBINATIONS....	140
<b>James R. Garfield</b> , Ex-Secretary of the Interior, Cleveland, Ohio.	

---

### PART IV

#### **THE POLICY OF GREAT BRITAIN, CANADA AND GERMANY AS COMPARED WITH THAT OF THE UNITED STATES WITH REFERENCE TO INDUSTRIAL COMBINATIONS**

THE CANADIAN COMBINES INVESTIGATION ACT.....	149
<b>W. L. Mackenzie King, C.M.G., Ph.D.</b> , Former Minister of Labour of Canada, and Author of "The Combines Investigation Act."	
BUSINESS AND POLITICS AT HOME AND ABROAD.....	156
<b>Gilbert H. Montague</b> , Counsellor-at-Law, New York.	

## *Contents*

v

	PAGE
ATTITUDE OF GERMAN PEOPLE AND GOVERNMENT TO- WARDS TRUSTS.....	172
<b>Rudolf Roesler, LL.D.</b> , Consulting Engineer, New York.	
POLICIES OF GERMANY, ENGLAND, CANADA AND THE UNITED STATES TOWARDS COMBINATIONS.....	183
<b>Francis Walker</b> , Bureau of Corporations, Washington.	
DISCUSSION.....	202

---

## PART V

### THE EFFECT OF THE SHERMAN ANTI-TRUST LAW ON THE BUSINESS OF THE COUNTRY

THE SHERMAN ANTI-TRUST LAW AND THE BUSINESS OF THE COUNTRY.....	219
<b>Joseph T. Talbert</b> , Vice-President, National City Bank of New York.	
GOVERNMENT REGULATION OF BIG BUSINESS IN THE FUTURE.....	238
<b>Henry R. Seager, Ph.D.</b> , Professor of Political Economy, Columbia University.	
EFFECT OF THE ANTI-TRUST LAW ON GENERAL BUSINESS..	246
<b>Alexander D. Noyes</b> , Financial Editor, "Evening Post," New York.	
THE BOGEY OF THE "PATENT MONOPOLY".....	251
<b>Gilbert H. Montague</b> , New York.	
DISCUSSION.....	263

---

## PART VI

### THE ELEMENTS OF A CONSTRUCTIVE NATIONAL POLICY WITH REFERENCE TO INDUS- TRIAL COMBINATIONS

THE ADMINISTRATION'S THEORY OF A CONSTRUCTIVE POLICY CONCERNING COMBINATIONS	
I. Address by <b>President Taft</b> .....	273
II. Address by <b>George W. Wickesham</b> , Attorney-General of the United States.....	277
CORPORATE REGULATION—AN ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE...	284
<b>Herbert Knox Smith</b> , Commissioner of Corporations, Washington.	

	PAGE
REVIEW AND CRITICISM OF ANTI-TRUST LEGISLATION.....	289
<b>Francis G. Newlands</b> , United States Senator from Nevada.	
LIMITATIONS OF ANTI-TRUST LEGISLATION.....	296
<b>James M. Beck</b> , New York.	
FEDERAL INCORPORATION OF INTERSTATE CORPORATIONS	303
<b>Ernest W. Roberts</b> , Member of Congress from Massachusetts.	
CONTROL OF CORPORATIONS, PERSONS AND FIRMS ENGAGED IN INTERSTATE COMMERCE.....	310
<b>John Sharp Williams</b> , United States Senator from Mississippi.	
<hr/>	
COMMUNICATION—THE COST OF THE Isthmian SHIP CANAL	331
<b>John C. Trautwine, Jr.</b> , Philadelphia.	
NOTES AND DISCUSSIONS.....	334
Fisher's "The Purchasing Power of Money."	
The Scope of the Sherman Act; The Intention of Its Framers.	
BOOK DEPARTMENT.....	342
REPORT OF THE ANNUAL MEETING COMMITTEE.....	375
INDEX.....	379

## BOOK DEPARTMENT

CONDUCTED BY ROSWELL C. McCREA

## NOTES

BONHAM—*The British Consuls in the Confederacy* (p. 342); BUTLER—*Sales-women in Mercantile Stores* (p. 342); CORNELL—*Health and Medical Inspection of School Children* (p. 343); CRANE—*Business and Kingdom Come* (p. 343); CROSS—*The Essentials of Socialism*, and SPARGO and ARNER—*Elements of Socialism* (p. 343); CURRIER—*Lands of the Southern Cross* (p. 344); DRESSER—*Human Efficiency* (p. 344); GRAHAM—*Undiscovered Russia* (p. 345); HAMMOND—*The Village Laborer* (p. 345); LARYMORE—*A Resident's Wife in Nigeria* (p. 346); LEVINE—*The Labor Movement in France* (p. 346); LEVY—*Monopoly and Competition* (p. 347); LOTTIN—*Quetelet Statisticien et Sociologue* (p. 347); McCARTHY—*The Wisconsin Idea* (p. 347); MACGREGOR—*The Evolution of Industry* (p. 348); MARSH—*Taxation of Land Values in American Cities* (p. 348); MARTIN—*Salvador of the Twentieth Century* (p. 348); MUIR—*Christianity and Labour* (p. 349); REYNOLDS AND WOOLEY—Seem's So—*A Working Class View of Politics* (p. 349); SCOTT—*The Counsel for the Defense* (p. 350); SIMIAND—*La Méthode Positive en Science Economique* (p. 350); SMITH—*All the Children of All the People* (p. 351); STOUT—*New Zealand* (p. 351); THWING—*Universities of the World* (p. 351); TURNER—*The Negro in Pennsylvania* (p. 352).

## REVIEWS

BAILEY— <i>The Country Life Movement in the United States</i> (p. 353) . . . . .	W. S. Tower
BALL— <i>The Chinese at Home</i> (p. 353) . . . . .	C. P. Newton
BARING— <i>The Russian People</i> (p. 354) . . . . .	C. L. Jones
BOUTROUX— <i>Science and Religion in Contemporary Philosophy</i> (p. 355),	R. C. McCrea
BOYD— <i>The Educational Theory of Jean Jacques Rousseau</i> (p. 356) . . . . .	A. G. Spencer
BRADFORD— <i>Commission Government in American Cities</i> (p. 357) . . . . .	C. L. King
BRODE— <i>British and German East Africa</i> (p. 358) . . . . .	J. P. Goode
<i>The Cambridge Medieval History</i> , Vol. I (p. 359) . . . . .	A. C. Howland
CHAMBERLAIN— <i>The Principles of Bond Investment</i> (p. 361) . . . . .	T. Conway, Jr.
DAVENPORT— <i>Heredity in Relation to Eugenics</i> (p. 361) . . . . .	C. Kelsey
DICKERSON— <i>American Colonial Government, 1696-1765</i> (p. 363) . . . . .	W. E. Lunt
DINGLE— <i>Across China on Foot</i> (p. 364) . . . . .	C. L. Jones
EARP— <i>The Social Engineer</i> (p. 365) . . . . .	C. Kelsey
ELLIS— <i>The Problem of Race-Regeneration; SALEEBY—The Method of Race-Regeneration; NEWSHOLME—The Declining Birth-Rate</i> (p. 366) . . . . .	S. Nearing
FERRIMAN— <i>Turkey and the Turks</i> (p. 367) . . . . .	C. L. Jones

FISHER— <i>Political Unions</i> ; DE FRONSAC— <i>Liberalism and Wreck of Empire</i> (p. 368).....	W. E. Lunt
FORBUSH— <i>The Coming Generation</i> (p. 368).....	S. Nearing
GEIL— <i>Eighteen Capitals of China</i> (p. 369).....	C. P. Newton
GEPHART— <i>Principles of Insurance</i> (p. 370).....	B. D. Mudgett
GOODNOW— <i>Social Reform and the Constitution</i> (p. 371).....	C. L. King
GOODRICH— <i>The Coming China</i> (p. 372).....	J. P. Lichtenberger
LINDSAY— <i>Cuba and her People of To-day</i> (p. 373).....	J. P. Goode
WINTER— <i>Argentina and Her People of To-day</i> (p. 373).....	W. S. Tower

PART ONE

---

*The Effect of Industrial Combinations  
on Labor Conditions*

PART TWO

---

*Competition as a Safeguard to  
National Welfare*

PART THREE

---

*The Relation of Industrial Combinations  
to National Welfare*

PART FOUR

---

*The Policy of Great Britain, Canada and  
Germany as Compared with that of  
the United States with Ref-  
erence to Industrial  
Combinations*

PART FIVE

---

*The Effect of the Sherman Anti-Trust  
Law on the Business of the Country*

PART SIX

---

*The Elements of a Constructive National  
Policy with Reference to Indus-  
trial Combinations*